

**RE: Can you send me the recent ARSG data summaries and charts you have presented?**

**Sabrina Forrest** to: Peter Butler

10/27/2011 10:53 AM

From: Sabrina Forrest/R8/USEPA/US

To: "Peter Butler" <butlerpeter2@gmail.com>

Cc: "Bill Simon" <wsimon@frontier.net>, <fearneng@rmi.net>, Jennifer Lane/R8/USEPA/US@EPA

---

Hi Peter, I hope the meeting last week was productive. I am sorry I could not be there. Thanks for your thoughts on the existing outreach to the larger community, which I recognize has occurred recently. We are planning to develop a web page and will post some frequently asked Q's and A's, and our available documents. We are also working to respond to Mr. Wright's and other letters that we are receiving from community members who have not attended ARSG meetings, but which point to the need for the ongoing education I mentioned earlier.

Sincerely,

Sabrina Forrest  
Site Assessment Manager  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1595 Wynkoop Street, Mail Code: 8EPR-B  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
Direct Ph: 303-312-6484  
Toll Free: 1 800-227-8917, 312-6484  
Fax: 303-312-6065  
Agency Cell: 303-589-1286

E-mail: [forrest.sabrina@epa.gov](mailto:forrest.sabrina@epa.gov)

NOTICE: The information contained in this e-mail is intended only for the use of the recipient(s) named above. This message and any attachments may contain confidential or privileged information. If the reader is not the intended recipient or an agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you have received this document in error and any review, dissemination, disclosure, distribution, use, or copying of the contents of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify me immediately by e-mail or telephone and destroy all copies of the original message and any attachments.

"Peter Butler" ---10/21/2011 10:22:53 AM---Sabrina – We will continue to do outreach, but I wanted to point out that there has been quite a bit

From: "Peter Butler" <butlerpeter2@gmail.com>

To: Sabrina Forrest/R8/USEPA/US@EPA, "Bill Simon" <wsimon@frontier.net>

Cc: <fearneng@rmi.net>, Jennifer Lane/R8/USEPA/US@EPA

Date: 10/21/2011 10:22 AM

Subject: RE: Can you send me the recent ARSG data summaries and charts you have presented?

---

Sabrina – We will continue to do outreach, but I wanted to point out that there has been quite a bit over the past six months.

In May, we did a community update in Town Hall about ARSG and current issues we face.

In August, I summarized the issues again before EPA's and BLM's presentations.

In September, we had our tour and almost 40 people attended, including Silverton High School students who are studying the water quality issues.

In late Sept, Steve and I made a detailed presentation on ARSG and water quality to the Animas River Protection work group in Town Hall.

In addition, of course there were the EPA listening sessions and meetings with the town council and county commissioners that you and Jennifer did, the front page color spread and article the Durango Herald did, plus there have been at least three more articles, and several articles in the Silverton Standard.

Peter Butler  
970-259-0986

**From:** Forrest.Sabrina@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Forrest.Sabrina@epamail.epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 20, 2011 11:57 AM  
**To:** Bill Simon  
**Cc:** Peter Butler; fearneng@rmi.net; Lane.Jennifer@epamail.epa.gov  
**Subject:** RE: Can you send me the recent ARSG data summaries and charts you have presented?

**Thanks again Bill. We will incorporate this into our response to Mr. Wright, but I think this and other questions from the public indicate there is much to be done with regard to outreach in order to inform and educate those outside the ARSG as to why the group has continued to do its work all these years and believes the problems in upper Cement Creek are impacting the Animas and are important to address.**

**Regardless of whether CERCLA is one of the tools used, I believe the citizenry/community needs enough information to understand that a framework and process are going to have to be developed and followed in order to understand background metals' influence on the situation, mining-related contributions, changes in site conditions in the last decade or so, the importance and applicability of water quality standards, that it will take time to determine the best path forward to improve water quality, and the study and remedy(ies) will be expensive. I know I am preaching to the choir, but I believe this sort of community outreach and education would help the overall process be better understood. Does the ARSG have any plans to do community outreach and education?**

Sincerely,

Sabrina Forrest  
Site Assessment Manager  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1595 Wynkoop Street, Mail Code: 8EPR-B  
Denver, CO 80202-1129

Direct Ph: 303-312-6484  
Toll Free: 1 800-227-8917, 312-6484  
Fax: 303-312-6065  
Agency Cell: 303-589-1286

E-mail: forrest.sabrina@epa.gov

NOTICE: The information contained in this e-mail is intended only for the use of the recipient(s) named above. This message and any attachments may contain confidential or privileged information. If the reader is not the intended recipient or an agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you have received this document in error and any review, dissemination, disclosure, distribution, use, or copying of the contents of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify me immediately by e-mail or telephone and destroy all copies of the original message and any attachments.

-----"William Simon" <wsimon@frontier.net> wrote: -----

To: Sabrina Forrest/R8/USEPA/US@EPA  
From: "William Simon" <wsimon@frontier.net>  
Date: 10/20/2011 09:10AM  
Cc: "Peter Butler" <butlerpeter2@gmail.com>, <fearneng@rmi.net>, Jennifer Lane/R8/USEPA/US@EPA  
Subject: RE: Can you send me the recent ARSG data summaries and charts you have presented?

At 3 mile siding, near Cascade Creek, there was only Brook trout caught whereas brown, rainbow, and one cut or cutbow was previously recorded from that spot. Elk Park area also saw decline in numbers and size classes of the only trout ever present (brook). Bill

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Forrest.Sabrina@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Forrest.Sabrina@epamail.epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 20, 2011 8:35 AM  
**To:** Bill Simon  
**Cc:** Peter Butler; fearneng@rmi.net; Lane.Jennifer@epamail.epa.gov  
**Subject:** RE: Can you send me the recent ARSG data summaries and charts you have presented?

Bill, I certainly would appreciate your input. My first thought was to describe the electrofishing results from 2005 vs. 2010 and the water quality data that you refer to from A72 and Baker's Bridge, as well as comparisons to Animas WQS. I could not recall however, if one of the three trout species that declined in the 2010 survey included cutthroat. I am presently looking for the data that I thought I received from CDOW.

Sincerely,

Sabrina Forrest  
Site Assessment Manager  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1595 Wynkoop Street, Mail Code: 8EPR-B  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
Direct Ph: 303-312-6484  
Toll Free: 1 800-227-8917, 312-6484  
Fax: 303-312-6065

Agency Cell: 303-589-1286

E-mail: forrest.sabrina@epa.gov

NOTICE: The information contained in this e-mail is intended only for the use of the recipient(s) named above. This message and any attachments may contain confidential or privileged information. If the reader is not the intended recipient or an agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you have received this document in error and any review, dissemination, disclosure, distribution, use, or copying of the contents of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify me immediately by e-mail or telephone and destroy all copies of the original message and any attachments.

-----"William Simon" <wsimon@frontier.net> wrote: -----

To: Sabrina Forrest/R8/USEPA/US@EPA, <butlerpeter2@gmail.com>, "Steve Fearn" <fearneng@rmi.net>

From: "William Simon" <wsimon@frontier.net>

Date: 10/19/2011 06:07PM

Subject: RE: Can you send me the recent ARSG data summaries and charts you have presented?

Hi all, Peter or I can easily send the current graphs for A72 and Baker's bridge. The explanation for supportive of aquatic life, as you know, is a bit more complicated depending upon which organisms one wants to support. I can take a stab at it or ? Bill

-----Original Message-----

From: Forrest.Sabrina@epamail.epa.gov

[<mailto:Forrest.Sabrina@epamail.epa.gov>]

Sent: Wednesday, October 19, 2011 11:14 AM

To: butlerpeter2@gmail.com; wsimon@frontier.net; Steve Fearn

Subject: Can you send me the recent ARSG data summaries and charts you have presented?

Hi all, Due to ongoing low back issues that have gotten severe recently, I need to have a MRI and won't be able to attend this month's meeting. Steve Way will be there.

I would like to respond to some questions that Jennifer Lane and I received via email from a San Juan County resident, John Wright. EPA did not collect any water quality data for points below A72; however, I don't have a complete set of those most recent data and charts but I recall the charts that ARSG has recently compiled could help us answer part of his questions. He asked,

"...at what mile downstream from that confluence the Animas waters presently clean themselves up to the point that it supports aquatic life for native species. Comments from the floor of the meeting in Silverton stated that the Animas water in Durango was "good." The comment was

uncontested. Therefore, that mile point exists somewhere between Durango and Silverton..."

Thanks for your help. I hope you all have a very productive meeting.

Sincerely,

Sabrina Forrest  
Site Assessment Manager  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1595 Wynkoop Street, Mail Code: 8EPR-B  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
Direct Ph: 303-312-6484  
Toll Free: 1 800-227-8917, 312-6484  
Fax: 303-312-6065  
Agency Cell: 303-589-1286

E-mail: [forrest.sabrina@epa.gov](mailto:forrest.sabrina@epa.gov)

NOTICE: The information contained in this e-mail is intended only for the use of the recipient(s) named above. This message and any attachments may contain confidential or privileged information. If the reader is not the intended recipient or an agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you have received this document in error and any review, dissemination, disclosure, distribution, use, or copying of the contents of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify me immediately by e-mail or telephone and destroy all copies of the original message and any attachments.

=

=